# OPEN MEETING ITEM







2001 DEC 21 P 2: 55

DATE:

DECEMBER 21, 2007 AZ CORP CONTROL

DOCKET NO:

RR-03639A-07-0493

TO ALL PARTIES:

Enclosed please find the recommendation of Administrative Law Judge Marc E. Stern. The recommendation has been filed in the form of an Opinion and Order on:

## THE UNION PACIFIC RAILROAD COMPANY (CLOSURE OF A RAILROAD CROSSING)

Pursuant to A.A.C. R14-3-110(B), you may file exceptions to the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge by filing an original and ten (10) copies of the exceptions with the Commission's Docket Control at the address listed below by 4:00 p.m. on or before:

#### **DECEMBER 31, 2007**

The enclosed is NOT an order of the Commission, but a recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge to the Commissioners. Consideration of this matter has tentatively been scheduled for the Commission's Working Session and Open Meeting to be held on:

JANUARY 15 and JANUARY 16, 2008

For more information, you may contact Docket Control at (602) 542-3477 or the Hearing Division at (602) 542-4250. For information about the Open Meeting, contact the Executive Secretary's Office at (602) 542-3931.

Arizona Corporation Commission DOCKETED

DEC 21 2007

MOCK! HUBY

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

#### BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION **COMMISSIONERS** 3 MIKE GLEASON - Chairman WILLIAM A. MUNDELL JEFF HATCH-MILLER KRISTIN K. MAYES **GARY PIERCE** 6 DOCKET NO. RR-03639A-07-0493 IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF THE UNION PACIFIC RAILROAD COMPANY FOR THE CLOSURE OF A RAILROAD CROSSING AT LA PALMA ROAD IN THE DECISION NO: CITY OF ELOY, PINAL COUNTY, ARIZONA AT AAR/DOT NO. 741 710H. OPINION AND ORDER 10 December 17, 2007 DATE OF HEARING: 11 PLACE OF HEARING: Phoenix, Arizona 12 Marc E. Stern ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: 13 Mr. Terrance L. Sims, Beaugureau, Zukowski, Hancock, APPEARANCES: Stoll and Schwartz, P.C., Attorney for Union Pacific 14 Railroad Company; and 15 Ms. Kenya Collins, Staff Attorney, Legal Division, on behalf of the Safety Division of the Arizona Corporation 16 Commission. BY THE COMMISSION: 17 On August 24, 2007, the Union Pacific Railroad ("Railroad") filed with the Arizona 18 Corporation Commission ("Commission") an application for approval to close an existing crossing at 19 La Palma Road in the City of Eloy ("City") in Pinal County ("County"), Arizona at AAR/DOT No. 20 741 710H ("Application"). 21 On September 20, 2007, by Procedural Order, a hearing was scheduled and the Railroad was 22 ordered to notify any interested party of the Application and the hearing. On October 18, 2007, the Commission's Safety Division ('Staff') filed its report 24 recommending approval of the Application. 25 On November 15, 2007, the Railroad filed certification that it had provided public notice 26 pursuant to the Commission's Procedural Order. 27 On December 17, 2007, a full public hearing was held before a duly authorized 28

Administrative Law Judge of the Commission at its offices in Phoenix, Arizona. The Railroad and the Commission's Railroad Safety Section ("Staff") appeared with counsel. At the conclusion of the hearing, the matter was taken under advisement pending submission of a Recommended Opinion and Order to the Commission.

Having considered the entire record herein and being fully advised in the premises, the Commission finds, concludes, and orders that:

### FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. On August 24, 2007, the Railroad filed with the Commission a request for approval to close an existing crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at AAR/DOT No. 741 710H.
- 2. On September 20, 2007, the Commission issued a Procedural Order which ordered that a hearing be held and ordered that the Railroad provide public notice as follows: by mailing copies of the Application and Procedural Order to affected governmental entities and any other interested parties; by publishing notice of the proceeding in a newspaper of general circulation; and by posting visible signage within 90 feet of each side of the roadway approach to the crossing notifying the public of the proposed closure and hearing thereon. In response thereto, the Commission has received no objections to the Application.
- 3. The Railroad filed the Application upon the request of the City and National Gypsum, Inc. ("NGI"), a company that is building a new facility on the southwest corner of the intersection where the crossing is located.
  - 4. The hearing was held as scheduled on December 17, 2007.
- 5. The Application requests that the Railroad be authorized to abolish the crossing because the City and NGI have requested it. This will enable NGI to be served by the Railroad's industry track while an unnecessary public at-grade crossing can be eliminated.
- 6. La Palma Road is a north/south roadway that consists of two lanes of unmaintained gravel. Since 1977, the crossing has had automatic warning devices which consist of automatic

7.

9.

10.

11.

12.

13.

flashing lights and gates and it also has a concrete crossing surface.

which pass through the public crossing area at La Palma Road.

that approved and authorized Mr. Blanton to initiate the abandonment.

Staff recommendeds that the Application be approved.

Road crossing, the Railroad would complete the closure in approximately 60 days.

3

4

alternative routes which cross the Railroad's tracks as follows: Sunshine Road, which is a paved roadway, located approximately one mile to the west; and Picacho School Road, which is also a paved roadway, approximately four miles to the east.

With the elimination of the La Palma Road crossing, the public will have two

Staff testified that the La Palma Road crossing will be closed by the Railroad, which

The Railroad's Manager of Industry and Public Projects, Mr. James Smith, testified

The Commission's Staff received a letter from Mr. Joseph Blanton, the City's Interim

Mr. Smith anticipates that, upon Commission approval of the closure of the La Palma

will remove its safety devices, block the crossing, and also remove the crossing surface. The cost of

that it is the Railroad's normal policy when public at-grade crossings are closed to contribute \$10,000

to the local government. In this case, the City, as the local road authority, will receive \$10,000 after

Manager, in support of the Application. Staff also obtained a copy of a City Council Action Form

5 6

8. According to an engineering study performed in 2007, there is very little traffic on the road with average daily traffic of approximately 60 vehicle crossings a day. There are 48 trains a day

the closure will be borne by the Railroad and NGI.

the Commission's approval of the closure.

8

7

10

11

12

13

1415

16

17

18

19 20

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

21

<u>CONCLU</u>

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Commission has jurisdiction over the parties and over the subject matter of the Application pursuant to Article XV of the Arizona Constitution and A.R.S. §§ 40-336, 40-337 and 40-337.01.
  - 2. Notice of the Application was provided in accordance with the law.
- 3. The closure of the crossing at La Palma Road at AAR/DOT No. 741 710H is in the public interest.

3

DECISION NO.

recommended by Staff.  ORDER  IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Union Pacific Railroad's Application approved.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall company s				
By Therefore Ordered that Union Pacific Railroad's Application approved.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall of removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall of removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  It Is Is Is FURTHER ORDERED that Union Pacific Railroad Company shall of removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  It Is	1	4. Pursuant to A.R.S. §§ 40-336 and 40-337, the Application should be approved as		
IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Union Pacific Railroad's Application approved.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall c removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall c removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Union Pacific Railroad Company shall c removal of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Union Pacific Railroad Company shall c removal of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.	2	recommended by Staff.		
approved.  IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall or removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  It is a second or second	3	<u>ORDER</u>		
IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall c removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.  It is not shall be a second or shal	4	IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Union Pacific Railroad's Application is hereby		
removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.	5	approved.		
8 No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008. 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27	6	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall complete the		
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27	7	removal of its crossing at La Palma Road in the City of Eloy in Pinal County, Arizona at AAR/DOT		
10          11          12          13          14          15          16          17          18          19          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	8	No. 741 710H, as described in the application, by May 31, 2008.		
11          12          13          14          15          16          17          18          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	9	•••		
12          13          14          15          16          17          18          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	10	· · ·		
13          14          15          16          17          18          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	11			
14          15          16          17          18          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	12			
15          16          17          18          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	13			
16          17          18          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	14			
17          18          19          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	15			
18          19          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	16			
19          20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	17			
20          21          22          23          24          25          26          27	18			
21          22          23          24          25          26          27	19			
22          23          24          25          26          27				
<ul> <li>23</li> <li>24</li> <li>25</li> <li>26</li> <li>27</li> </ul>		•••		
<ul> <li>24</li> <li>25</li> <li>26</li> <li>27</li> </ul>				
<ul> <li>25</li> <li>26</li> <li>27</li> </ul>				
26 27		•••		
27		•••		
28				
	28			

1	IT IS FURHTER ORDERED that the Union Pacific Railroad Company shall notify the		
2	Commission, in writing, within 10 days of both the commencement and the completion of the		
3	removal of the crossing.		
4	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Decision shall become effective immediately.		
5	BY ORDER OF THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION.		
6	DI ORDER OF THE FREE OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PR		
7			
8	CHAIRMAN COMMISSIONER		
9			
10	COMMISSIONER COMMISSIONER COMMISSIONER		
11	DANIE MILIEDE DE L'OEAN C'MILIED Interim		
12	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I, DEAN S. MILLER, Interim Executive Director of the Arizona Corporation Commission, have hereunto set my hand and caused the official seal of the		
13	Commission to be affixed at the Capitol, in the City of Phoenix, this day of, 2007.		
14	this, 2007.		
15			
16	DEAN S. MILLER  DIFFERENCE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR		
17	INTERIM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR		
18			
19	DISSENT		
20			
21			
22	DISSENT		
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	5 DECISION NO		

1	SRVICE LIST FOR:	UNION PACIFIC RAILROAD COMPANY		
2	DOCKET NO.:	RR-03639A-07-0493		
3	Anthony J. Hancock			
5	Terrance L. Sims BEAUGUREAU, ZUKOWSKI,			
6	HANCOCK, STOLL & SCHWARTZ, P.C. 302 East Coronado Road			
7	Phoenix, AZ 85004 Attorneys for Union Pacific Railroad Company			
8	James H. Smith			
9				
10	Roseville, CA 95747			
11	John Syers Railroad Engineering Coordinator			
12	ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION  205 South 17 <sup>th</sup> Avenue, M/D 618E			
13				
14	1 railic Records Section			
15				
16	Phoenix, AZ 85007			
17	Greg Stanley, P.E. Director/County Engineer			
18	PINAL COUNTY DEVELOPMENT SERV P.O. Box 727	TICES		
19	31 North Pinal Street, Bldg. F Florence, AZ 85232			
20				
21	Christopher Kempley, Chief Counsel Legal Division			
22	ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSIC 1200 West Washington Street	DN .		
23	Phoenix, Arizona 85007			
24	Brian Lehman, Chief Railroad Safety Section			
25	ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSIC 1200 West Washington Street	N		
26	Phoenix, Arizona 85007			
27				
28				

6